

Supporting information for “A systematic benchmark of the ab initio Bethe-Salpeter equation approach for low-lying optical excitations of small organic molecules”

Fabien Bruneval,^{1,2,3} Samia M. Hamed,^{2,4,3,5} and Jeffrey B. Neaton^{2,3,5}

¹⁾ CEA, DEN, Service de Recherches de Métallurgie Physique, F-91191 Gif-sur-Yvette, France

²⁾ Molecular Foundry, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, California 94720, United States

³⁾ Department of Physics, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, United States

⁴⁾ Department of Chemistry, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, United States

⁵⁾ Kavli Energy Nanosciences Institute at Berkeley, Berkeley, California 94720, United States

All the energies in the present document are in eV.

I. THIEL'S SET SINGLET RESULTS

Molecule		Symmetry	BTE Ref. 1	TD-DFT B3LYP Ref. 2	BSE PBE MOLGW	BSE B3LYP MOLGW	BSE BHLYP MOLGW	BSE tCAM-B3LYP MOLGW
Series 1	Ethene	B_{1u}	7.80	7.70	7.26	7.48	7.70	7.66
	E-Butadiene	B_u	6.18	5.74	5.31	5.60	5.89	5.85
		A_g	6.55	6.82	6.18	6.83	7.46	7.28
	all-E-Hexatriene	B_u	5.10	4.69	4.24	4.57	4.88	4.84
		A_g	5.09	5.69	4.94	5.73	6.49	6.34
	all-E-Octatetraene	A_g	4.47	4.84	4.06	4.91	5.71	5.60
		B_u	4.66	4.02	3.54	3.90	4.23	4.19
	Cyclopropene	B_1	6.76	6.46	6.03	6.30	6.66	6.48
		B_2	7.06	6.31	6.15	6.37	6.65	6.57
	Cyclopentadiene	B_2	5.55	5.02	4.49	4.79	5.08	5.00
Norbornadiene		A_1	6.31	6.52	5.92	6.43	6.83	6.77
		A_2	5.34	4.79	4.64	4.91	5.19	5.11
		B_2	6.11	5.52	5.52	5.86	6.23	6.07
Series 2	Benzene	B_{2u}	5.08	5.40	4.60	4.88	5.21	5.10
		B_{1u}	6.54	6.10	5.53	5.79	6.05	6.03
		E_{1u}	7.13	7.07	6.31	6.60	6.93	6.84
	Naphthalene	E_{2g}	8.41	8.91	7.38	8.11	8.83	8.79
		A_g	5.87	6.18	5.26	5.68	6.12	6.04
		A_g	6.67	6.85	6.31	6.79	7.24	7.08
		B_{1g}	5.99	5.58	4.96	5.41	5.91	5.84
		B_{1g}	6.47	6.32	5.54	5.89	6.26	6.24
		B_{2u}	4.77	4.35	3.77	4.09	4.42	4.37
		B_{2u}	6.33	6.12	5.43	5.75	6.09	6.05
	Furan	B_{3u}	4.24	4.44	3.71	4.00	4.33	4.25
		B_{3u}	6.06	5.93	5.22	5.52	5.83	5.76
		B_2	6.32	6.16	5.54	5.86	6.17	6.05
	Pyrrole	A_1	6.57	6.70	5.92	6.31	6.77	6.63
A_1		8.13	8.25	7.45	7.80	8.17	8.06	
	A_1	6.37	6.53	6.50	6.10	6.76	6.66	

	A_1	7.91	7.96	7.88	7.53	7.88	7.78
	B_2	6.57	6.40	5.80	6.09	6.37	6.29
Imidazole	A'	6.19	6.45	5.76	6.10	6.45	6.33
	A'	6.93	7.04	6.27	6.60	6.97	6.87
	A''	6.81	6.46	5.79	6.06	6.59	6.43
Pyridine	A_1	6.26	6.31	5.67	5.96	6.25	6.21
	A_1	7.18	7.32	6.48	6.82	7.13	7.08
	B_2	4.85	5.49	4.63	4.93	5.27	5.15
	B_2	7.27	7.30	6.42	6.76	7.18	7.03
	B_1	4.59	4.80	4.08	4.46	4.95	4.77
	A_2	5.11	5.11	4.33	4.73	5.29	5.11
Pyrazine	B_{1u}	6.58	6.50	5.79	6.11	6.41	6.36
	B_{1u}	7.72	7.68	6.64	7.06	7.49	7.38
	B_{2u}	4.64	5.37	4.44	4.76	5.10	4.95
	B_{2u}	7.60	7.78	6.73	7.13	7.57	7.46
	A_u	4.81	4.69	3.93	4.32	4.86	4.67
	B_{1g}	6.60	6.38	5.36	5.89	6.58	6.38
	B_{2g}	5.56	5.55	4.62	5.10	5.66	5.47
	B_{3u}	3.95	3.96	3.25	3.62	4.08	3.88
Pyrimidine	A_1	6.95	6.58	5.87	6.20	6.51	6.46
	B_2	5.44	5.74	4.79	5.13	5.48	5.36
	B_1	4.55	4.27	3.51	3.88	4.36	4.20
	A_2	4.91	4.60	3.83	4.21	4.72	4.56
Pyridazine	A_1	5.18	5.61	4.58	5.13	5.34	5.21
	A_2	4.31	4.18	3.36	4.21	4.34	4.15
	A_2	5.77	5.44	4.66	5.35	5.69	5.45
	B_1	3.78	3.58	2.79	3.88	3.70	3.50
s-Triazine	A'_2	5.79	6.14	5.07	5.44	5.83	5.71
	A''_1	4.60	4.45	3.65	4.04	4.54	4.39
	A''_2	4.66	4.64	3.82	4.20	4.68	4.52
	E''	4.70	4.64	3.76	4.15	4.64	4.48
s-Tetrazine	A_u	3.51	3.51	2.67	3.08	3.64	3.41
	A_u	5.50	5.04	4.35	4.73	5.34	5.10
	B_{1g}	4.73	4.73	3.57	4.20	4.83	4.60
	B_{2g}	5.20	5.29	4.15	4.81	5.34	5.10
	B_{2u}	4.93	5.58	4.23	4.81	5.20	5.04
	B_{3u}	2.29	2.24	1.35	1.78	2.26	2.04
Series 3 Formaldehyde	A_2	3.88	3.89	3.08	3.36	3.77	3.59
	B_1	9.10	8.89	7.98	8.38	8.84	8.69
Acetone	A_1	9.30	9.17	8.99	9.30	9.70	9.06
	A_2	4.40	4.34	3.36	3.72	4.19	3.97
	A_1	9.40	9.04	8.55	9.02	9.47	9.43
	B_1	9.10	8.60	8.43	8.60	9.20	8.79
p-Benzoquinone	A_u	2.77	2.55	1.57	2.16	2.77	2.57
	B_{1g}	2.76	2.43	1.53	2.11	2.72	2.47
	B_{1u}	5.28	4.83	3.73	4.63	5.06	5.01
	B_{3g}	4.26	3.73	3.28	3.78	4.25	4.01
	B_{3g}	6.96	6.59	5.50	6.38	7.08	6.83
	B_{3u}	5.64	5.43	4.60	5.22	5.95	5.81
Formamide	A''	5.63	5.55	4.64	4.96	5.36	5.26
	A'	7.39	8.13	7.45	7.76	8.18	8.20
Acetamide	A''	5.69	5.56	4.63	4.95	5.39	5.26
	A'	7.27	7.46	6.81	7.16	7.56	7.54
Propanamide	A''	5.72	5.59	4.64	4.96	5.41	5.27
	A'	7.20	7.76	6.77	7.13	7.56	7.52
Series 4 Cytosine	A'	4.66	4.64	3.78	4.17	4.59	4.56
	A'	5.62	5.42	4.60	5.10	5.55	5.51
	A''	4.87	4.76	4.12	4.54	4.96	5.05
	A''	5.26	5.11	4.26	4.91	5.59	5.40
Thymine	A'	5.20	5.00	4.33	4.72	5.13	5.02

	A'	6.27	5.97	5.24	5.71	6.26	6.19
	A'	6.53	6.31	5.78	6.21	6.69	6.54
	A''	4.82	4.70	3.83	4.24	4.74	4.65
	A''	6.16	5.80	5.09	5.55	6.08	5.98
Uracil	A'	5.35	5.19	4.43	4.82	5.24	5.13
	A'	6.26	5.87	5.17	5.65	6.21	6.13
	A'	6.70	6.50	5.89	6.33	6.82	6.66
	A''	4.80	4.63	3.80	4.21	4.70	4.62
	A''	6.10	5.74	5.02	5.48	6.01	5.92
	A''	6.56	6.14	5.52	6.14	6.71	6.56
Adenine	A'	5.25	5.27	4.51	4.83	5.18	5.14
	A'	5.25	5.00	4.31	4.69	5.18	5.00
	A''	5.12	4.97	4.25	4.67	5.10	5.05
	A''	5.75	5.61	4.86	5.27	5.79	5.65
<hr/>							
MSE		—	-0.08	-0.82	-0.41	0.03	-0.09
MAE		—	0.26	0.82	0.45	0.21	0.25
<hr/>							

II. THIEL'S SET TRIPLET RESULTS

Molecule	Symmetry	BTE	TD-DFT	BSE	BSE	BSE	BSE
		Ref. 1	Ref. 2	B3LYP PBE MOLGW	B3LYP MOLGW	BHLYP MOLGW	tCAM-B3LYP MOLGW
Series 1 Ethene	B_{1u}	4.50	4.03	3.58	3.75	3.97	3.76
E-Butadiene	A_g	5.08	4.86	3.97	4.35	4.66	4.52
	B_u	3.20	2.76	2.37	2.59	2.81	2.62
all-E-Hexatriene	A_g	4.15	3.92	3.00	3.43	3.79	3.64
	B_u	2.40	2.09	1.68	1.92	2.18	1.99
all-E-Octatetraene	A_g	3.55	3.24	2.30	2.77	3.15	3.00
	B_u	2.20	1.68	1.23	1.50	1.79	1.61
Cyclopropene	B_2	4.34	3.70	3.57	3.68	3.90	3.77
	B_1	6.62	6.01	5.51	5.79	6.15	5.96
Cyclopentadiene	A_1	5.09	4.75	3.98	4.36	4.66	4.53
	B_2	3.25	2.71	2.30	2.51	2.73	2.55
Norbornadiene	A_2	3.72	3.08	2.82	2.98	3.20	3.07
	B_2	4.16	3.62	3.23	3.40	3.64	3.48
Series 2 Benzene	B_{1u}	4.15	3.77	3.26	3.44	3.65	3.48
	B_{2u}	5.88	5.09	4.25	4.52	4.81	4.73
	E_{1u}	4.86	4.70	3.96	4.21	4.50	4.39
	E_{1g}	7.51	7.33	5.95	6.54	7.13	7.01
Naphthalene	A_g	5.52	5.33	4.25	4.69	5.09	5.01
	A_g	6.47	5.95	4.99	5.40	5.88	5.77
	A_g	6.79	6.07	5.11	5.66	6.23	6.17
	B_{2u}	3.11	2.69	2.20	2.40	2.62	2.48
	B_{2u}	4.64	4.40	3.71	3.97	4.26	4.18
	B_{3u}	4.18	3.95	3.23	3.50	3.79	3.71
	B_{3u}	5.11	4.22	3.46	3.74	4.04	3.97
	B_{1g}	4.47	4.17	3.44	3.73	4.03	3.91
	B_{1g}	6.48	5.55	4.91	5.37	5.83	5.82

		B_{1g}	6.76	6.56	5.26	5.88	6.46	6.35
Furan		A_1	5.48	5.21	4.43	4.69	4.97	4.87
		B_2	4.17	3.71	3.17	3.38	3.62	3.44
Pyrrrole		A_1	5.51	5.25	4.47	4.74	5.04	4.92
		B_2	4.48	4.07	3.48	3.70	3.94	3.78
Imidazole		A'	4.69	4.24	3.65	3.87	4.12	3.96
		A'	5.79	5.44	4.65	4.94	5.29	5.11
		A'	6.55	5.95	5.01	5.32	5.74	5.56
		A''	6.37	5.83	5.01	5.37	5.88	5.67
Pyridine		A_1	4.06	3.89	3.33	3.54	3.75	3.58
		A_1	4.91	4.84	4.04	4.31	4.62	4.51
		B_2	4.64	4.51	3.69	3.96	4.24	4.13
		B_2	6.08	5.64	4.71	5.01	5.36	5.27
		B_1	4.25	4.04	3.29	3.66	4.17	3.94
		A_2	5.28	4.98	4.17	4.57	5.12	4.95
s-Tetrazine		A_u	3.52	3.10	2.26	2.66	3.20	2.96
		A_u	5.03	4.43	3.70	4.16	4.70	4.44
		B_{1g}	4.21	3.63	2.49	3.09	3.68	3.43
		B_{1u}	4.33	3.83	2.79	3.37	3.64	3.46
		B_{1u}	5.38	5.24	4.01	4.52	4.89	4.75
		B_{2g}	4.93	4.48	3.40	3.93	4.50	4.27
		B_{2u}	4.54	4.06	2.93	3.41	3.70	3.56
		B_{3u}	1.89	1.42	0.63	1.00	1.45	1.21
Series 3	Formaldehyde	A_2	3.50	3.13	2.31	2.58	3.00	2.80
		A_1	5.87	5.18	1.51	4.59	4.93	4.76
	Acetone	A_2	4.05	3.69	2.68	3.03	3.51	3.27
		A_1	6.03	5.39	4.53	4.96	5.30	5.17
	p-Benzoquinone	A_u	2.62	2.05	1.00	1.59	2.28	1.97
		B_{1g}	2.51	1.92	0.97	1.54	2.16	1.89
		B_{1u}	2.96	2.19	1.21	1.95	2.20	2.06
		B_{3g}	3.41	2.68	2.19	2.56	2.84	2.70
	Formamide	A''	5.36	4.97	4.03	4.34	4.74	4.62
		A'	5.74	5.13	4.17	4.44	4.80	4.64
	Acetamide	A''	5.42	5.01	4.04	4.36	4.81	4.65
		A'	5.88	5.26	4.27	4.59	4.99	4.80
	Propanamide	A''	5.45	5.04	4.06	4.38	4.84	4.68
		A'	5.90	5.28	4.31	4.61	5.02	4.83
MSE			—	-0.44	-1.28	-0.89	-0.52	-0.68
MAE			—	0.44	1.28	0.89	0.52	0.68

III. THIEL'S MOLECULES HOMO-LUMO GAP

Molecule	CCSD(T)	gKS	GW	GW	GW	GW	GW
	GAUSSIAN09	B3LYP MOLGW	PBE MOLGW	B3LYP MOLGW	BHLYP MOLGW	tCAM-B3LYP MOLGW	HF MOLGW
Series 1 Ethene	13.34	7.40	12.64	12.83	13.08	13.03	13.46
E-Butadiene	10.66	5.45	9.66	9.98	10.34	10.24	10.80

	all-E-Hexatriene	9.14	4.39	7.94	8.32	8.76	8.64	9.28
	all-E-Octatetraene	8.17	3.74	6.81	7.24	7.73	7.61	8.31
	Cyclopropene	12.57	6.77	11.93	12.13	12.41	12.37	12.84
	Cyclopentadiene	10.44	5.33	9.47	9.77	10.11	9.99	10.57
	Norbornadiene	10.56	5.58	9.72	10.01	10.37	10.26	10.85
Series 2	Benzene	11.31	6.63	10.38	10.66	11.00	10.93	11.43
	Naphthalene	8.92	4.72	7.90	8.20	8.56	8.49	9.00
	Furan	11.46	6.36	10.65	10.96	11.30	11.18	11.74
	Pyrrrole	10.87	6.61	10.35	11.01	10.83	10.80	11.25
	Imidazole	11.91	6.79	10.85	11.38	11.31	11.28	11.72
	Pyridine	11.06	6.12	9.88	10.35	10.83	10.74	11.25
	Pyrazine	10.92	5.31	9.25	9.71	10.62	10.08	11.03
	Pyrimidine	10.73	5.66	9.57	10.01	10.59	10.42	11.65
	Pyridazine	9.94	4.91	8.76	9.24	9.88	9.66	10.76
	s-Triazine	11.16	5.94	10.02	10.46	11.04	10.87	10.83
	s-Tetrazine	8.97	3.66	7.83	8.32	8.92	8.65	9.75
Series 3	Formaldehyde	12.45	5.87	11.62	11.97	12.44	12.32	13.10
	Acetone	11.81	6.24	10.59	11.13	11.79	11.56	13.03
	p-Benzoquinone	8.76	3.79	7.23	7.91	8.68	8.40	9.82
	Formamide	13.31	7.48	12.34	12.82	12.99	12.90	13.80
	Acetamide	12.31	7.42	11.84	12.34	12.30	12.80	13.25
	Propanamide	12.24	7.42	11.28	11.72	12.23	12.14	13.23
Series 4	Cytosine	9.80	5.29	8.83	9.20	9.65	9.59	10.24
	Thymine	9.97	5.40	9.03	9.41	9.88	9.72	10.50
	Uracil	10.30	5.60	9.61	9.74	10.21	10.06	10.83
	Adenine	9.75	5.34	8.68	9.05	9.51	9.38	10.12
<hr/>								
	MSE	—	-5.06	-1.01	-0.61	-0.19	-0.31	0.41
<hr/> <hr/>								

¹M. Schreiber, M. R. Silva-Junior, S. P. A. Sauer, and W. Thiel, J. Chem. Phys. **128**, 134110 (2008).

²M. R. Silva-Junior, M. Schreiber, S. P. A. Sauer, and W. Thiel, J. Chem. Phys. **129**, 104103 (2008).